Kapadokya İki Yıllık Meslek Yüksek Okulu Restorasyon Programının Değerlendirilmesi

An Evaluation of Cappadocia Vocational College Two-year Restoration Curriculum

Ahmet OK[*], Hatice ÇİLSALAR[**], Yelda SARIKAYA ERDEM[***]

Öz

Yükseköğretimin en önemli kademelerinden biri olan mesleki yükseköğretim, bireylerin mesleki bilgi ve becerilerini esas alarak üretken ve çağın gereksinimlerine ayak uyduran ara elemanlar yetişmesini amaçlamakta ve bu doğrultuda, iş hayatının ihtiyaçlarını dikkate alarak hazırlandığı düşünülen programları uygulamaya koymaktadır. Programların beklendiği şekilde işleyip işlemediği, amaçlarına ulaşıp ulaşmadığı ve beklenen bilgi, beceri ve tutumları geliştirip geliştirilemediğinin belirlenmesi eğitim programlarının doğası gereğidir. Bu çalışmada Nevşehir ilinde eğitim vermekte olan Kapadokya Meslek Yüksekokulu'nun bölgenin tarihi ve doğal yapısının sürekliliğini sağlamak ve bölge işverenlerinin ihtiyaçlarını karşılamak amacıyla kurulan Restorasyon Bölümü için hazırlanmış olan eğitim programının etkililiğinin paydaşlar açısından değerlendirmesi amaçlanmıştır. Program paydaşları olarak bu çalışmaya; öğrenciler (n=28), öğretim elemanları (n=7), işverenler (n=4) ve mezunlar (n=6) katılmıştır. Çalışmada paydaşların programa yönelik görüşleri, anket ve görüşme yoluyla alınmıştır. Araştırma hem amaç odaklı hem de amaçtan bağımsız program değerlendirme modeline dayandırılmıştır. Veri analizi için istatistiksel yöntemler ve içerik analizi yöntemi kullanılmıştır. Elde edilen bulgulara göre program çıktılarına tam anlamıyla ulaşılamadığı görülmüştür. Elde edilen bulgular, öğrencilerin programın sonunda kendilerini genellikle yetersiz hissettikleri ve programın bazı çıktılarının çalışma hayatı için uygun bulunmasına rağmen, paydaşların disiplinsizlik gibi amaçlanmayan çıktıların çalışma hayatında problemler yaratabileceğini göstermektedir. Programın yanıt verebileceği ihtiyaçlar bakımından tekrar gözden geçirilerek geliştirilebileceği, teknik ve materyal donanımları için kaynak ayrılması ve temin yoluna gidilmesi gerektiği anlaşılmıştır.

Anahtar sözcükler: Program değerlendirme, mesleki eğitim, restorasyon, paydaş algıları.

Abstract

Higher vocational education, a crucial pillar of higher education, aims at providing individuals with the vocational knowledge and skills to enable them to be semi-qualified productive and adaptable members to the requirements of era by delivering curricula designed in accordance with labor market demands. By its nature, any delivered curricula are subject to evaluation in relation to achieving their goals, their functioning, reaching desired knowledge, skills and attitudes. This study aimed to evaluate the curriculum of Restoration department at Cappadocia Vocational College in Nevşehir, offered to contribute to the protection of natural and historical sites, and to meet employers' demands in the region. Participants of the study were students (n=28), instructors (n=7), employers (n=4), and graduates (n=6). The study was based on stakeholders' opinions on curriculum assessed through questionnaires and interview *subjectives evaluation model* and *goal-free evaluation model*. Data were analyzed by using statistical methods and content analysis method. Results indicated that students felt incompetent at the end of the program. Additionally, although some outcomes were found useful for worklife, unintended outcomes like indiscipline were estimated by stakeholders to pose problems during the worklife. Finally, it was found necessary to revise the program for remedying technical and equipment shortages.

Key words: Curriculum evaluation, vocational education, restoration, stakeholders' perceptions

[*] Prof. Dr., Middle East Technical University, Department of Educational Sciences, Curriculum and Instruction, Ankara-Türkiye, e-mail:as@metu.ed.tr

[**] Res. Assist., Middle East Technical University, Department of Educational Scinces, Curriculum and Instruction, Ankara-Türkiye, e-mail: cihatice@medu.edu.tr

[***] Instructor., Kapadokya Vocational College, e-mail: yelda.sarıkaya@kapadokya.edu.tr

Introduction

Today's work places have undergone a major transition due to the advances in technology and the shift to knowledge and service based work settings, and these driving changes provide implications for workplaces, employees and higher education institutions. The change in workplaces urges the traditional workplace model to be replaced by an emerging model that leads to new working arrangements (The Secretary's Commission on Achieving Necessary Skills (SCANS), 1991), new production methods, and recruitment of "autonomous and qualified workers who are self-directed, multi skilled, lifelong learners, and use technology (The Canadian Labor Force Development Board (CLFDB), 1994; SCANS, 1991). This transformation urges candidate employees furnish their skills through training to meet rapidly changing corporate requirements (CLFDB, 1994).

In this context, higher education is considered as one of the key factors for improving or maintaining the competitiveness of enterprises and national economies, provision of productive society and equal opportunities (Bloom, Canning and Chan, 2005; OECD, 2008; World Bank, 2002). Within higher education, higher (post-secondary) vocational education is a crucial pillar since colleges are distinguished with their singular emphasis on teaching practical knowledge and skills while universities place additional emphasis on research, social service and teaching (Lederer, 2005).

From a wider perspective, according to Cohen and Brawer (2003), the common functions of higher vocational education and training provided by two-year colleges are 1) academic transfer (colleges prepare students for transfer to four-year institutions or award of associates' degree), 2) professional/technical education (students study at professional/technical programs provided by colleges for a terminal degree or working upon completion), 3) continuing education (rigorous industry certifications for skill upgrade and professional development offered by colleges in collaboration with professional associations or private vendors), 4) basic skills/developmental education (skills shortages of poorly prepared secondary school graduates are remedied by colleges), and 5) community service (colleges serve as cultural and recreational centers for their communities). Therefore, in order to provide stakeholders' with beneficial results, higher vocational education intends to develop craftsmanship, practical experience and practical problem-solving. In Harvey's (2000) words, higher vocational education is supposed to prepare students for the workplace by "transforming students by enhancing their knowledge, skills, attitudes and abilities while simultaneously empowering them as lifelong critical, reflective learners" (p. 3).

Within the above raised aim, the curriculum implemented in higher vocational training institutions is expected to raise individual's productivity, develop their skills and abilities. In addition to this, that curriculum requires learning activities in formal vocational and technical school programs, in training centers or institutes, and in the workplace, both on and off the job (Tsang, 1997), so the curriculum delivered in higher vocational schools must be designed in accordance with labor market needs to make graduates able to enter the world of work with required know-how knowledge and practical skills. To meet the demands, the schools providing vocational education and training need to develop strong links with business and enterprises to create workforce that would meet the demands of the labor market. In the report of Turkish Industry and Business Association (TÜSİAD), Restructuring Vocational and Technical Education in Turkey (1999) it is marked that Turkey was ranked 21st among 30 countries which were listed in accordance with their efficacy in university and industry collaboration and Turkey's rank was stated to be 23rd among 26 countries with regard to productivity of the workforce. To remedy this, Ziderman (1997) offers some strategies. First of all, vocational school curricula need to be broader for supporting future trainability of employees and it should allow the employers to play an active role in curriculum development process. Furthermore, curricula need to be more flexible to update themselves based on the evolving labor market needs. Secondly, work place training opportunities should be enhanced, as they are crucial to provide the practice for trainee's occupational skills in a real work environment. And finally, career counseling and guidance services must be provided to improve encouragement (Ziderman, 1997). At this point, in order to catch the changing demands of market, higher vocational education should be strongly linked to the industry.

In more recent years, allocation of huge resources and budgets posed more challenges as administrators and program managers have had to struggle to keep programs afloat (Fitzpatrick, Sanders, &Worthen, 2004), indicating the need for effective and efficient decisions on the programs. Therefore, it is needed to have information about the effectiveness of the program which can be provided by program evaluation through gathering information and data following scientific processes. It provides basis for policy decision and feedback on the continuous program adjustments and process of program implementation. In brief, worth and merit of a specific program can be decided via program evaluation.

The Restoration program, context of this study, started to be offered among the Cappadocia Vocational College (**CVC**) programs in 2005 to meet the growing need for educated workforce by the employers in Nevşehir. While designing the curriculum to be delivered to the students of the program, employers in Nevşehir who are expected to recruit the graduates from this program, architects having expertise in the restoration-conservation area and representatives from Conservation Council were involved. Since 2005, there has been no evaluation study on the effectiveness of the curriculum in terms of meeting the needs and demands of employers. In addition to that, it is crucial to determine the actual goals and students' achievement level at the end of the program to evaluate the effectiveness of the intended program. Therefore, itis necessary to examine if there is a mismatch between skills and knowledge requirement of the world of work in Nevşehir, and skillsand knowledge produced by CVC.

Within this study, therefore, it was aimed 1) to evaluate the curriculum of two-year Restoration program in terms of its effectiveness in responding to the expectations of employers according to the perceptions of second graders studying at the program, instructors teaching at the program, graduates and employers who are expected to employ those graduates, 2) to determine the actual outcomes which are not specified within the curriculum goals, 3) to determine the achievement of program goals according to the perceptions of second graders studying at the program, instructors teaching at the program, graduates and employers, and 4) to collect data for the improvement of the program.

Along with these aims, this study sought answers to the following questions: (1) What are the program's goals and content and how is it implemented? (2) Do the curriculum objectives match with national qualifications?, (3) What are the perceptions of students about their achievement level of curriculum objectives?, (4) What are the perceptions of instructors about students' achievement of curriculum objectives?, (5) What are the perceptions of graduates about their attainment of curriculum objectives?, (6) What are the perceptions of employers about the graduates competency?(7) What are the unintended outcomes of Restoration curriculum according to stakeholders? Answering these research questions would lead to the evaluation of two-year restoration program which would provide program developers, instructors, administrators, andrelated stakeholders direction and feedback on program effectiveness.Based on the findings they can review curriculum's different components to make it more appropriate so as to satisfy the expectation of all related stakeholders. Results and procedures applied in this studywill motivate CVC and similar vocational colleges to evaluate their existing program.

Method

Research Design

This study adopted a quantitative-qualitative convergentdesign(Creswell & Clark, 2011) where the researcher collects data concurrently, analyzes quantitative data and qualitative data separately and merges results or interpretation The convergent parallel design is utilized to evaluate the two-year Restoration curriculum at Cappadocia Vocational College. Qualitative and quantitative methods, namely mixed method provide a more complete picture of a situation (Fraenkel & Wallen, 2006), and also it gives more detailed information from a broader perspective. By combining and increasing the number of research methods used within a particular project, researchers become able to broaden the

dimension, and hence the scope of the project by using more than one method within a research program, and they obtain a more complete picture of human behavior and experience (Tashakkori & Eddlie, 2002).

Evaluation Model(s)

This study utilized two evaluation models: a) Tyler's Goal-Oriented and b) Scriven's Goal-Free, to evaluate the effectiveness of Restoration program at CVC. Both of the models were followed during the data collection process which is explained in detail. Tyler's evaluation model is the main curriculum evaluation models that fall in the objective evaluation category Fitzpatrick, Sanders & Worthen, 2004) and utilitarian perspective (Gredler, 1996). It aims at evaluating weather objectives of a curriculum are attained or not. This model follows seven steps given below:

1. Establish broad goals or objectives
2. Classify the goals or objectives
3. Define objectives in behavioral terms
4. Find situations in which achievement of objectives can be shown
5. Develop or select measurement techniques (validity and reliability studies)
6. Collect performance data, and
7. Compare performance data with behaviorally stated objectives (Fitzpatrick, Sanders & Worthen, 2004).

Johnson (1988) indicates several advantages of this model which are 1) its simplicity that makes it easy to understand and interpret, 2) its focus on measurable objectives which encourages accountability and provides teachers with a means to demonstrate progress to parents and administrators, and finally, 3) its inclusion of the intervener as an integral member of the evaluation process and employing more than just pre/post measures.

As a second model, Scriven's Goal-Free evaluation model was selected for the evaluation of the restoration program because it is appropriate to define unstated objectives, to eliminate the evaluator's bias during evaluation and to provide a base for linking the evaluation to other methodologies such as anthropological and historical methods (Gredler, 1996). Scriven's aim of developing this model is to move evaluators beyond the objective implementations by urging the evaluators to examine program in order to find unintended outcomes (Fitzpatrick, Sanders & Worthen, 2004). Especially, this model helps researcher not to lose focus on unintended outcomes while measuring of students' objective attainment. Therefore, goal-free evaluation prevents tunnel vision and provides the evaluator with the information of many positive and/or negative unintended side-effects. Fitzpatrick, Sanders & Worthen (2004) describe the characteristics of goal-free evaluation as following:

1. The evaluator purposefully avoids becoming aware of the program goals.
2. Predetermined goals are not permitted to narrow the focus of the evaluation study.
3. Goal-free evaluation focuses on actual outcomes rather than intended program outcomes.
4. The goal-free evaluator has minimal contact with the program manager and staff.
5. Goal-free evaluation increases the likelihood that unanticipated slide effects will be noted.

Based on the abovementioned characteristics, goal-free evaluation provides the evaluator with the information regarding actual processes and outcomes according to the perceptions of consumers who are employers, employees and students within the context of this study.

Utilization of two models at the same time has some significant advantages in evaluation of this program. Since goal-based evaluation model gives importance to outcomes rather than specific points of program, focuses on gathering information about the effectiveness of program considering not only

participants' needs but also employers' needs. These features makes easy to evaluate a college program. Beside this model, within goal-free evaluation effectiveness of the program is determined by relating program effects to the relevant needs of the impacted population according to their perceptions by leading to the perception of process and detection of the unintended outcomes. Hence, these two models guided the researchers to determine the effectiveness of the program in terms of accomplishment of the specified and actual goals. It is also necessary to notice that although these to evaluation models correspond to objective evaluation category (Fitzpatrick, Sanders &Worthen, 2004) they serve different purposes, this is the basic reason to utilize both in this particular study.

Participants

In this study, four main groups were involved as major data sources: They were second-year students at the restoration program, instructors, graduates of CVC restoration program and employers (those who employ CVC restoration program graduates).

Students involved in the study were the ones studying in the fourth academic semester (a two semester system) at the program and were expected to graduate in May, 2013. There was 28 second-year students in the college, so all were invited to participate. Out of 28 students who participated in the study, 15 (% 53.6) were female while 13 of them (% 46.4) were male, indicating an almost equal distribution of gender.

As one indicator of their motivation to study at this vocational college they were asked the reason for choosing to study there. Their responses indicated that16 of them were interested and wanted to be restorators, 5(five) wanted to study at any higher education institution and the others raise different reasons like their close/near residence etc.

Beside students, both employed and unemployed graduates participated in this study. The criterion for the selection of graduates was that both either resided or worked in Nevşehir and those who volunteered to participate and contribute were selected as participants of the study. Six graduates participated in the study, four of whom were working for a company but two of them were unemployed.

There were seven (7) instructors, either part-time or full-time faculty, who lecture in the field of restoration; at CVC, all of the seven (7) instructors participated in study. As for demographic data obtained during interviews with the instructors, it was found out that seven instructors were working for this department. Out of seven instructors, four were male and three of them were female. Their ages ranged from 26 to 58 with the mean age of 35.9. While three of them had been working only for one year at this department, two of the instructors had been working for 6 years, the others worked for 8 years. Additionally, all of them were part-time instructors. Three of them had field experience, while others did not.

Finally, employers who are the key stakeholders for this study were requested to share their views about the qualifications of the graduates and also students of CVC. Four employers participated in the study, two of whom hired some employees who graduated from CVC while the other two had not recruited any employees who graduated from CVC yet. Equal number of participants from both sides was chosen intentionally for the purpose of collecting objective information about graduates' qualifications from all parties. Three of them were female and one of them was male. While one of them had been working in the restoration department of a hotel in Cappadocia to restore the cave rooms, three of them had been working in their own companies which conduct restoration projects.

Instruments

Considering the models that were utilized, both the level of achievement of pre-specified objectives and actual/unintended outcomes needed to be considered. Along with this need, data were collected through student questionnaires and interviews that were administered to students, instructors, employers and graduates.

Student questionnaire was administered with the participation of 28 students while focus group interview was conducted with 6 students. Beside those, four employers and six graduates were interviewed. All interviews in this study were semi-structured interviews because they consist of a series of questions designed to elicit specific answers from respondents (Frankel & Wallen, 2006), and they allow researchers to ask extra question to make draw a clear picture in a specific topic.

*Student questionnaire*consisted of three parts: 1) demographic information, 2) achievement of curriculum objectives and importance of achievement of curriculum objectives, and 3) contribution of the curriculum to their preparation for work life. to the demographic part covered items on gender, age, reason for choosing the restoration program, satisfaction from the program. The second part was bi polar; in one pole students were expected to rate the degree of achievement of objective on a 4 points scale ranging from *1= little to 4 = a lot*. .On the other pole they rated the same items (objectives) in relation to their importance on a four points scale ranging from *1= not important* to*4= very important*. The third part included two pen ended questions where students were asked to rise their opinions about what knowledge and skills should CVC restoration curriculum develop so you can easily find a job and become more successful in workplace.

This bi polar 26 item questionnaire was prepared by the researchers. The items/ propositions were basically derived from curriculum objectives. For this purpose the CVC restoration curriculum was used as a source. As for the validity issue an expert in the field of Curriculum and Instruction, the CVC program instructor was consulted. For face validity three (3) students were asked to read and respond to questions for the sake of clarity and understandability. The feedback received for content was considered and several items were revised by content. Student responses were considered and five (5) items were simplified. The Cronbach's alpha for the level of achievement was 0.92 and for importance of objectives was 0.90.

The focus group interview: "The focus group is a special type of group in terms of purpose, size, composition and procedures" (Krueger & Casey, 2011, 4). The aim of the focus group was to assess students opinions about their level of achievement of curriculum objective in addition to questionnaire explained in the above paragraphs. The researchers/moderatorslisten and gather information from the participants who have some common characteristic. Krueger and Casey (2011) proposed a 6-8 members group to be suitable. In the present study six students participated who were all 4th semester students and were about to graduate. The focus group interview questions were aimed at querying participants'achievement level of the objectives, the objectives they feel competent and incompetent, the areas they feel a need to improve, the knowledge and qualifications that the program provided, and their recommendations for improving the program. An experts' opinion about interview schedule was obtained in relation to content, clarity and wording of the question. Based on feedback received three questions were revised and combined in one question and stated as: How do you evaluate the CVC restoration program, what are its strengths and weaknesses? The final form of the interview schedule consisted of 7 main questions.

Instructor Interview Schedule: This semi-structured individual interview schedule was developed by the researchers one of whom was member of the program under evaluation. The schedule consisted of nine (9) demographic data seeking items and 12 open ended questions. The questions were built around curriculum objectives, their achievement, related materials, strength and weaknesses of CVC restoration program, parts to be revised, and possibility for graduates to get employed. Initially there were 13 questions however after consulting for expert opinion one question was omitted as it was related to courses of the program. Furthermore six items seeking demographic information were added also.

Employer interview schedule: A six(6) questions interview form developed by the researchers for the purpose of exploring employers views on the criteria for the selection of employees, qualifications expected of the graduates from Restoration program at CVC for getting employed, CVC graduates' qualification incompetence recommendations to make CVC graduates more qualified, suggestions for

increasing employability of CVC Restoration department graduates. The procedure followed for developing the Employer interview schedule was almost the same with the procedure followed in Instructor interview schedule.

Graduate's interview schedule: The interview schedule included nine(9) questions. By this individual interview schedule graduates were asked about their working status, if not employed, reasons for not being employed by a company, their competences and incompetence, the areas they feel a need to improve, the knowledge and qualifications that the program provided, general evaluation of the restoration program, and recommendations for making the program more effective. A similar process as in Instructor interview schedule was followed in preparing this schedule.

Data Collection Procedures

Due to chosen models, there is a requirement to collect information about outcomes of the program as both of the evaluation models are objective-oriented models (Fitzpatrick, Sanders & Worthen, 2004). Two types of data collection instruments were used as introduced in **Instruments** section.

In order to collect data, at the beginning of the process, permission from college administrators was obtained, and all instructors and students were informed about the study. Data were collected during May, the spring termin 2012-2013 academic years. First, student questionnaire was administered in the English lesson which required all students to attend. This was the most suitable time in order to reach all students at the same time. The attendance in the other classes was not that high. Before administering the questionnaire one of the researchers explained the aim of the study as well as students were informed that they can return the questionnaire if they do not want to participate. All students present in the class volunteered to participate. It took students 20-25 minutes to complete the questionnaire. A day later the focus group interview was conducted. Six students voluntarily accepted to join the focus group session. An office was arranged for the session where students would feel comfortable and not interruption happen. Before starting the focus group discussion the researcher asked for permission to tape record the session, this request was kindly accepted by all participants. İt is worth to notice that all participants were ensured that the records and the interview transcripts will not be used in other than research and participants permission. The session lasted circa 60 to 70 minutes.

Instructor interviews were conducted in the institution (CVC). Individual interview was preferred because it was not possible to schedule all the seven instructors for same day and hours. It was much more convenient to schedule individual interviews. For this purpose instructors' weekly schedules were obtained from the college secretary. The instructors' off hours were determined and then they were contacted for arranging the time of interview. After this planning process, individual interview process began. At the beginning of each interview permission for audio recording was requested, obtained and the interviewees were informed that records and transcripts will not be used other than research purposes. All instructor interviews were completed in a week time and the interviewing proses lasted approximately 40 to 50 minutes for each.

The employer and graduate interviews were conducted after receiving necessary information about them from both college administrators and instructors. Next, they were called by phone to make appointments. The employers who accepted to participate were interviewed in their offices. The graduate interviews were conducted in the office of one of the researchers who is the faculty of the intuition. As it was the case for instructors and focus group interviews, permission for audio recording was taken from all employers and graduates before the interview began. Four employers and six graduates were interviewed in a week during the same semester. Each interview lasted circa 50 to 60 minutes.

Data Analysis

Data analysis was conducted in three steps.In the first step atwo-stage document analysis was performed to answer the first two research questions. In the first stage of the analysis, the program was analyzed to check internal consistency of the curriculum by determining its goals, content, implementation and assessment procedures. In the latter stage, the program outcomes were compared against national vocational qualification framework for restorators to check consistency with the objectives.

Within the second phase, in order to answer the third research question of this study descriptive and paired sample t-test was employed using the statistical software of SPSS 20.0 with the objective of determining the differences between students' perceived achievement levels and the importance level of program objectives.

Finally, in order to answer other research questions, content analysis procedures were followed. First the recorded data was transcribed verbatim and then printed so that researchers become familiar with the data. Next the transcripts were printed on two column pages for the ease of group data into phrases, paragraphs and/or codes. Following the coding process suggested by Miles and Huberman (1994), emerging codes were determined with open coding procedure and codes were categorized with axial coding process. Finally, selective coding processes which involved examining the data sources closely for emerging codeswere used to develop categories for each research question. Each researcher coded data separately and crosschecked for inter-coder reliability. The inter-coder reliability, which was considered good according to Krippendorff's (2004) standards, was reached with 78% agreement on the codes.

Results

This part of introduces results of the study that are presented following the related research questions of the study. In order to answer the questions, data was categorized and represented within some specific dimensions, which specifically are degree of students' achievement at Restoration program, unachievable objectives by students, and unintended outcomes.

In order to set the stage and understand the nature of the curriculum under practice document analysis was conducted. At the beginning, documents like program outcomes, course syllabi and materials, assessment plans were collected. Then, content of the documents was examined. In the first phase of the document analysis, the program was examined and described with regard to curriculum components, which are aims and objectives, content, teaching-learning process and assessment. In the second phase, the curriculum outcome/objectives were compared against the required qualifications recommended by National Vocational Qualifications Institution (NVQI) in Turkey.

Curriculum Goals, Content and Implementation.

 The first research question of this evaluation study was about the nature of Restoration curriculum implemented at CVC. Based on the documents examined the curriculum of Restoration department was designed jointly by instructors, administrators and employers. Although the philosophy behind the program was not stated, the curriculum can be said to be based on social efficiency ideology as advocates of this ideology specify that the purpose of education is to "train youth in the skills and the procedures they will need in the workplace and at home to live productive lives and perpetuate the functioning of the society" (Schiro, 2008). Such a curriculum is organized into manageable small, discrete units that lead to simple and sequenced learning, and can be demonstrated through observable and measurable behaviors (Ozmon & Craver, 2007; Schiro, 2008).

In the following sub-sections, overall information on the aims, objectives, content, educational units and activities provided to meet the objectives; methods and evaluation system were provided.

a) Goals of the Curriculum

When the goals of the program were examined (Table 1), it was understood that the program aimed at equipping students with the theoretical and practical knowledge of restoration and conservation procedures and a few affective and psychomotor skills. Thus the goals were mostly set round cognitive domain of learning.

Table 1

Program Outcomes of Restoration Department

Students completing the program successfully will;

---

1. have knowledge of two distinct scales of historical surrounding and single construction conservation.

2. have the knowledge and understanding for restoration theories, principles of international contemporary conservation, national / international legal and organizational regulations and documentation of cultural heritage.

3. have knowledge and understanding for outbuilding at historical sites, contemporary constructions built at historical sites, quantity survey, restitution and preparation of reuse projects for the revival of cultural heritage

4. know the stages of conservation and sanitation of historical sites from a national and international point of view and will be able to conduct morphological and typological studies.

5. gain skills to be able to use information and communication technologies and other technical tools and software.

6. grasp his/her historical, social, cultural and legal responsibilities, adopt ethical, equitable and environmental values and gain practical skills

7. have the knowledge required for the conservation and restoration of single construction and historical sites.

8. gain effective verbal and written communication skills in Turkish.

9. achieve skills to conduct studies for the conservation and restoration of single construction and historical sites.

10. have verbal and written communication skills in English.

11. be able to make effective presentations.

12. have the practical knowledge about conservation techniques and constructional handicrafts.

The objectives stated in the cognitive domain could be grouped as; knowledge of legislations, procedures and documentation, use software and technologies, equipment and tools, and the methodology of conducting studies and conducting surveys on historical constructions. The psychomotor skills that students were supposed to achieve were verbal and written communication skills in Turkish and English, skills of technology usage, presentation, communication, and project management. The affective domain included attitudes related to the codes of ethics, environment and equality in restoration and conservation of historical assets.

b) Content

The courses offered in the CVC Restoration curriculum can be examined into two groups: must and elective courses. The must courses included the ones that Higher Education Council made obligatory for every higher education institution. To comply with Higher Education Council regulation, Turkish I, Turkish II, Atatürk's Principles, Turkish Revolution I, Turkish Revolution II, English and English II were offered as must courses. Fine arts and physical education were offered as elective courses one of which needed to be elected by students.

In the first term, the area courses were provided to make students knowledgeable in terms of art history, archeology, cultures that have influenced the region and concepts related to restoration and conservation. In addition,, students were introduced with technical drawing and related software and technologies to be utilized within the field.

Similarly, in the second term students were provided with the knowledge of different construction types and systems and legislative procedures needed to conduct conservation and restoration projects. The courses, Technical Drawing-II and Practicum in Architectural Software-II were delivered as continuation of the courses offered in the first term.

In the third term, detailed knowledge about construction types was presented. Beside the verbal information, students started to practice the knowledge via field study and workshops. Within these practice-based courses, students were taken to historical sites and constructions and provided with practical knowledge. Finally, fourth term was characterized with practicum courses and it was aimed to provide students with practical skills and know-how.

Internship done in the summer period at the end of the first semester was a prerequisite for graduation Additionally, students needed to attend seminars and extra-curricular activities offered by the college and realized with the participation of architects working in restoration-conservation field, employers and scholars who are invited to lecture students and inform them of the recent developments and trends in the field. Students attending each seminar were prized with points ranging from 5 to 10, and at the end of four-term training each student needed to have at least 200extracurricular activity points.

c) Instructional Methods

In knowledge-based subjects that are area courses instructors/ lecturers mostly utilized seminar-like instructor centered methods. Instructors, as the source of knowledge, transferred knowledge and students were expected to take notes, memorize the procedures, terms, and finally recite it. In practice-based courses, teachers guided students to put their knowledge into practice, turn the knowledge into skills, they acted like masters and students were viewed as apprentices.

d) Assessment

Within the semesters, students took both written exam and performance-based tests for the courses. Students were assessed through written exams in theory-based courses while it was performance what was assessed in practice-based courses. Written exams included both objective and essay type questions. As for the practical side, students performed given roles in stimulated conditions and they carried out the tasks required by each procedure.

Congruence of curriculum objectives with national qualifications

In the second step of document analysis, the program was compared with the required qualifications suggested by NVQI.

When the qualifications proposed by for restorators were compared with the program outcomes targeted at Restoration program, it was found out that the objectives and outcomes sought nationwide did not match. Firstly, some learning domains like occupational health, safety, quality management, and work organization given in national qualification list were not included as domains among the intended program outcomes. These domains were included in the program neither as course nor a topic.

It is quite clear that national qualifications focus on practice and the application of knowledge for the sake of practice, however such an emphasis was not laid in the program objectives. The qualifications implied that the knowledge was to be used while organizing, managing and performing restoration processes. Knowledge of the conservation concepts and traditional construction types were

necessary in decisions of processes and operation. The NQI qualifications are mostly expressed in verbs like "work", "make", "manage" or "perform" while the program objectives are stated mostly in verbs like "know", "gain", "achieve" or the phrase "have the knowledge of". This is significant to demonstrate the difference among NQI qualifications and CVC restoration curriculum outcomes. On the other hand, descriptive document analysis revealed that some program outcomes did not match with national qualifications. The use of technological equipment and tools, drawing skills, and the use of drawing software, use of English and Turkish in the work context were not specified among national qualifications. This could be related to the context of the school as it was situated in a region receiving a significant number of foreign visitors.

Achievement and degree of importance attached to curriculum objectives

Results related to students' perceptions about their achievement level of program objectives and the importance of curriculum objectives obtained through student questionnaires indicated that there was a significant difference between students' perceived achievement levelof objectives and the importance attached to these objectives for each item included in the questionnaire (Table 2)The results of paired samples t-test for.

Table 2

Paired Sample T-test Results on Attainment and Importance Degree of Objectives

	N	M Diff	t	Sd	Sig.
Will have the knowledge of restoration theories.	27	-1,07	-10,51	0,54	0,00
Will have the knowledge of principles of international contemporary conservation.	27	-0,89	-5,68	0,83	0,00
Will have the knowledge of national / international legal and organizational regulations and documentation of cultural heritage.	25	-0,73	-5,15	0,724	0,00
Will have the knowledge of national / international documentation of cultural heritage.	27	-0,64	-3,44	0,99	0,01
Will have the knowledge of outbuilding at historical sites contemporary constructions built at historical sites.	27	-0,89	-4,58	1,03	0,00
Will have the knowledge of restitution and preparation of reuse projects for reveal of cultural heritage.	27	-1,11	-6,69	0,88	0,00
Will have knowledge required for preparation of relieve projects of single construction and historical sites.	27	-1,18	-6,11	1,02	0,00
Will have knowledge required for preparation of restitution projects of single construction and historical sites.	27	-1,39	-7,42	0,99	0,00
Will have knowledge required for preparation of reuse projects of single construction and historical sites.	27	-1,14	-6,23	0,97	0,00
Will know the stages of conservation and sanitation of historical sites from national point of view.	27	-1,11	-7,45	0,79	0,00
Will know the stages of conservation and sanitation of historical sites from international point of view.	27	-1,04	-6,22	0,88	0,00
Will be able to conduct morphological studies for conservation and sanitation.	26	-1,48	-8,23	0,94	0,00
Will be able to conduct typological studies for conservation and sanitation.	27	-1,32	-6,41	1,09	0,00

Table 2 Continued

Will grasp his/her historical, social, cultural and legal responsibilities.	26	-0,96	-5,86	0,85	0,00
Will gain practical kills of his/her responsibilities.	27	-0,86	-6,00	0,76	0,00
Will adopt ethical, equitable and environmental values.	26	-0,67	-3,77	0,92	0,00
Will reflect gained values to practice.	26	-0,70	-4,44	0,82	0,00
Will have knowledge of single construction and historical sites.	25	-0,69	-4,21	0,88	0,00
Will gain effective verbal communication skills in Turkish.	26	-0,41	-3,05	0,69	0,01
Will gain effective written communication skills in Turkish.	25	-0,46	-2,60	0,91	0,01
Will gain skills to conduct studies for conservation and restoration of single construction and historical sites.	26	-1,00	-5,41	0,96	0,00
Will gain effective verbal communication skills in English.	27	-1,21	-6,46	0,99	0,00
Will gain effective written communication skills in English.	27	-1,32	-6,85	1,02	0,00
Will be able to make effective presentations.	25	-0,46	-2,90	0,81	0,01
Will have the practical knowledge about conservation techniques.	27	-1,04	-4,56	1,20	0,00
Will have the practical knowledge about constructional handcrafts.	27	-1,00	-4,72	1,12	0,00

each item in the questionnaire (Table 2) showed that students did not achieved objectives at the level they expected after two year training although they perceived all objectives to be "very important". Descriptive statistics also support the difference in perception of achieving objectives and importance attached to the objectives. The mean scores of 26 items regarding achievement varied from *M*= 3. 25 to *M*= 1.88 Table 3). Whereas the mean scores of importance attached to 26 items varied from *M*= 3.3.79 to *M*= 3.21 (Table 4). Careful examination of the mean scores on perception of achieving the objective indicted that they very between "little and much" on a four points scale. Whereas the mean scores on importance of objectives indicates that students rated items as "important" or "very important" (Table 4)

Table 3

Descriptive Statistics of Attainment Level of Objectives

	N	*M*	*SD*
Will have the knowledge of national/international documentation of cultural Heritage	28	3,04	0,92
Will be able to make effective presentations	27	3,00	0,83
Will gain effective written communication skills in Turkish	27	3,00	0,83
Will adopt ethical, equitable and environmental values	28	2,97	0,99
Will have knowledge of single construction and historical sites	27	2,97	0,90
Will reflect gained values to practice	28	2,93	0,90
Will gain practical kills of his/her responsibilities	28	2,80	0,72
Will gain skills to conduct studies for conservation and restoration of single construction and historical sites	28	2,75	0,80
Will know the stages of conservation and sanitation of historical sites from international point of view	28	2,71	0,85
Will have the knowledge of restoration theories	28	2,71	0,53

Table 3 Continued

Will have the knowledge of principles of international contemporary conservation	28	2,71	0,66
Will grasp his/her historical, social, cultural and legal responsibilities	27	2,70	0,77
Will have the knowledge of outbuilding at historical sites contemporary constructions built at historical sites	28	2,68	0,95
Will know the stages of conservation and sanitation of historical sites from national point of view	28	2,64	0,78
Will have the knowledge of national / international legal and organizational regulations and documentation of cultural heritage	26	2,62	0,75
Will have the knowledge of restitution and preparation of reuse projects for reveal of cultural heritage	28	2,57	0,88
Will have knowledge required for preparation of reuse projects of single construction and historical sites	28	2,50	0,88
Will have knowledge required for preparation of relieve projects of single construction and historical sites	28	2,50	0,79
Will gain effective verbal communication skills in English	28	2,32	1,02
Will be able to conduct typological studies for conservation and sanitation	28	2,29	0,90
Will have the practical knowledge about constructional handcrafts	28	2,21	1,03
Will have the practical knowledge about conservation techniques	28	2,21	1,07
Will gain effective written communication skills in English	28	2,21	0,96
Will have knowledge required for preparation of restitution projects of single construction and historical sites	28	2,21	0,79
Will be able to conduct morphological studies for conservation and sanitation	27	1,89	0,85

Based on these results it can be stated that the CVC Restoration curriculum should be improved and strengthened in order to at least improve student perceptions on achieving the curriculum objectives. This interpretation was strengthened when focus group results were examined. Descriptive content analysis indicated that students could not reach at the objectives due to: (1) lack of some measurement tools, (2) lack of some courses, (3) the academic focus of some courses, (4) low number of professional courses, (5) limited time and (6) lack of teacher guidance.

Students stated that they were not provided with the required tools and equipment like Total Station and laser scanner to be used for measurements. Moreover, instructors asked them to measure the buildings by hand although world of work would require them to use some technological devices. Besides that, students stated that as students were not delivered a course on construction materials they could not recognize the materials and this would have influenced their decisions negatively. Also, time allocated for technical drawing course was considered insufficient as it was difficult to learn drawing software. Students also marked that total duration allocated to study at this program was not enough to learn the job and restoration procedures. Student H and Student B stated that;

> … *(Student H)I bring the "station tool" from Ankara and do my task. It is an important one… Manual measurement is needed but we still have not finished-up even a mosque form the beginning of the semester (Student H).*

> *.. Manual measurements appear inconsistent; we are not sure which one to accept (Student B)*

Table 4

Descriptive Statistics of Importance of Objectives

	N	M	SD
Will have the knowledge of restoration theories	28	3,79	0,42
Will know the stages of conservation and sanitation of historical sites from international point of view	28	3,75	0,59
Will know the stages of conservation and sanitation of historical sites from national point of view	28	3,75	0,52
Will gain skills to conduct studies for conservation and restoration of single construction and historical sites	27	3,74	0,53
Will have the knowledge of national / international documentation of cultural heritage	28	3,68	0,48
Will have knowledge required for preparation of relieve projects of single construction and historical sites	28	3,68	0,55
Will have the knowledge of restitution and preparation of reuse projects for reveal of cultural heritage	28	3,68	0,55
Will gain practical kills of his/her responsibilities	28	3,68	0,48
Will gain effective verbal communication skills in Turkish	27	3,67	0,62
Will adopt ethical, equitable and environmental values	27	3,67	0,62
Will reflect gained values to practice	27	3,67	0,62
Will have knowledge of single construction and historical sites	26	3,65	0,57
Will have knowledge required for preparation of reuse projects of single construction and historical sites	28	3,64	0,56
Will be able to conduct typological studies for conservation and sanitation	28	3,61	0,79
Will grasp his/her historical, social, cultural and legal responsibilities	28	3,61	0,63
Will have the knowledge of principles of international contemporary conservation	28	3,61	0,57
Will have knowledge required for preparation of restitution projects of single construction and historical sites	28	3,61	0,63
Will have the knowledge of outbuilding at historical sites contemporary constructions built at historical sites	28	3,57	0,74
Will gain effective written communication skills in English	28	3,54	0,88
Will gain effective verbal communication skills in English	28	3,54	0,84
Will be able to make effective presentations	26	3,46	0,71
Will gain effective written communication skills in Turkish	26	3,46	0,76
Will have the knowledge of national / international legal and organizational regulations and documentation of cultural heritage	26	3,35	0,80
Will be able to conduct morphological studies for conservation and sanitation	28	3,32	0,86
Will have the practical knowledge about conservation techniques	28	3,25	1,00
Will gain effective verbal communication skills in Turkish	28	3,25	0,70
Will have the practical knowledge about constructional handcrafts	28	3,21	0,92

In addition to the equipment shortages and time limitation, students said that some courses which focused on academic knowledge did not consider their needs. They gave Turkish language courses as example. They noticed that Turkish courses offered in the first year did not focus on communication skills and writing official documents like petition and report, rather, they analyzed sentence and word structures. Students also thought that they needed more professional courses and extended hours of drawing and measurement techniques, and more guidance from instructors during field trips and construction surveys.

If 250 students of 300 fail the instructors should think a little, why is that? (Student H).

: In the literature course we are taught verbs root, names root etc., but they do not respond to our needs… we need practice, restorators should cooperate… Second year should be project based. Seminar activities should be monitored (Student C).

Instructors 'Perceptions of Students' Achievement of Program Objectives

The fourth question death with instructors' perceptions. Data for this particular question was gathered via individual interview. Descriptive content analysis results indicated that instructors found their students successful at "medium" level. Considering present students, overall, three of the instructors stated that only 60% of the students had been successful, while two of the instructors noted they found students successful but 100% success was not achieved. Two of them stated that they found students unsuccessful.

Closer examination of individual interviews in relation to objectives;, instructors stated that students gained some objectives like improvement of grammatical knowledge, structural development, development of writing skills, enhancement of knowledge of cultural property, development of problem solving skills, development of decision making skills, increase awareness for conservation, development of ability to determine the construction types, development of their understanding toward restoration, and making students aware about the significance of their work. One of the instructors who were asked about the attained objectives marked that:

"Our biggest handicap is that in real life, drawings are done by computer, this causes negligence among students. Our courses are like a part of architectural education and most of our students aim to benefit from the opportunity of vertical transfer among the departments, from restoration to architecture. Therefore they cannot concentrate on hand drawing. They think that they will do it on the computer anyway and we could not explain the need for the hand drawing. They cannot perceive its importance. I think they are right. I mean, I wonder if we can change the content of the course. We should increase computer use in the drawing courses."

In addition to these, students were expected to attain language skills that are speaking, reading, writing, and listening; however, instructors stated that they could not reach the objectives related to speaking in English and knowledge of grammar. One of the instructors stated that:

"I think the objectives related to grammar could not be reached. We tried to give key points but students could not reach at the level I expected. The reason of this is the basic and secondary education. Students came here by taking eight-year Turkish language course but they behave as if they did not study same topics at all."

This statement indicated that students' background caused some difficulties in gaining the objectives, and instructors had to make an extra effort to fulfill the gap between the students' current level and expected level due to lack of students' prior knowledge.

In addition to the instructors' views related to attaining objectives, their perceptions about graduates' qualifications were also analyzed. The analysis showed that three of the instructors found graduates quite qualified however one of the instructors stated that *"…Only 20% of them are qualified, not all of them…"* While others found students qualified at some points, such as, restoration skills, field study and software use, one of them stated that they had limited drawing skills and three-dimensional thinking skills.

Graduates' Perceptions of the Attainment of Curriculum Objectives

The fifth question of this study pursed answer to graduates (employed and unemployed) attainment of curriculum objectives. Qualitative data analysis revealed that graduates and thought those who were good at school could find a job easily, they felt competent at relievo, preparation and implementation of restoration projects and adaptation to the region which is covered with tectonic constructions.

In addition to attained objectives, graduates stated that there had been some unattained objectives in the program that are related to application and designing issues, construction materials, tri-dimensional drawing, and conservation itself. In addition to these, although graduates felt competent in some areas they stated that they needed to improve themselves constantly. One of the employed graduates emphasized that (Employed Graduate 1):

"I have to develop myself in all aspects. All dimensions of the restoration can change fast because of technological changes…Restoration is a huge area and I still have a lot of things to learn."

As for the reasons behind unattained objectives, graduates marked that the instructors were qualified and experienced. However teaching strategies they use could be enriched and improved. Strategies applied were mostly conversional. They also stated that visits to restoration areas were meaningful, but did not produce intended results as learners were not informed about the process, the idea behind restoration and the project.. Although one graduate marked that learning to learn was more important, two graduates expressed that content was presented tangential, more detailed content was required.

Like students, graduates also raiseda need for a course on construction materials a need for knowledge of report writing, and tender documentation. These were considered as unattained curriculum objectives

Employers'Perceptions of Graduates Competence

According to employers, employees have to have some qualifications to be recruited as restorators. A graduate need to: (1) be enthusiastic, (2) be disciplined, (3) have architectural drawing skills and knowledge, (4) have the knowledge of drawing programs like AutoCAD, Tri-D etc., (5) measure constructions and draw according to measurement, (6)read projects, (7) know restitution steps, (8) be good at relievo, (9)be good at report writing,(10)know occupational health and safety procedures,(11) communicate with the workers, and (12) manage projects and make work organization. As seen below, one of the employers stated the qualifications that are expected from graduates (Employer 1):

"…I want them be enthusiastic and disciplined youngsters. In this region, there is a huge richness and they have to be aware of this. Also they have to be enthusiastic to do this job and have to be disciplined. They should learn this at school. As far as I observed, I sometimes visit the school as an expert, students do not come to their lessons in time. Timing is the most important indicator of discipline."

Similarly, another employer raised additional issues on qualifications that graduates need to have (Employer 2):

"They have to take good relievo, draw a building and write report of the project, such as a relievo report in which construct materials are specified and all problems related to construction, such as ground problems, material problems, rock or chimney problems were described, and to decide whether it is to be removed, conserved or restored. Anyone who can do this is a restorator for us; this is the most important point."

As it is evident in the above two quotations employers do not only look for cognitive or motor skills but also affective characteristics, discipline, enthusiasm and awareness.

Unintended Outcomes of Restoration Curriculum

In order to determine the unintended outcomes, all participants interviewed were asked to disclose their perceptions on unintended outcomes. To start with, as students reported; they developed skills in generating alternatives as they try to find the equipment not supplied by the school.*"…I can do my project by bringing the total station machine from Ankara…"(Student H).* The other unintended outcome was students skills on producing practice an economical ideas for different stakeholders. They propose thought about how they could both contribute to themselves and to school budget:

"…We can be helpful for circulating capital, and create a budget in the college. We can draw projects for public and sell them"(Student D). "There are precious buildings around the college especially in the village that the college is located in and these can be saved…(Student H)

Besides, they develop social relations skills. As they do field practice on restoration they could communicate with the employees who are working in the restoration field and could watch others communicate and take the mas role models. Similar unintended outcome was raised by instructors. They also mentioned the development of enthusiasm that was stated as a requirement by employer and 3-D thinking. One negative unintended outcome mentioned by employers was misbehavior on disconformity of time.

Discussion and Conclusion

When the program was evaluated from the perceptive of students, instructors, graduates and employers, the results indicated that the program was not effective enough in achieving it objectives, some of the national standard and the demands and needs of students, graduates of employers. To summarize the results, firstly it was found out that students could not attain the objectives despite the fact that they considered all of the objectives "very important" or "important". During the focus group interview, students expressed the reasons for and the objectives they could not attain. Students reported that due to the lack of teacher guidance, equipment and materials, insufficient number of professional courses, limited mandated-time allocated for the program, and defocus on academic know ledgein some courses they could not attain the objectives.

Beside students, instructors also reported that although the program met their expectations in terms of improving grammatical knowledge of students in Turkish and English, improving students' problem solving skills, improving students' writing skills in Turkish and English, enhancing knowledge of cultural property, improving students' knowledge and skills in solving problems related to restoration of a cultural property, developing students' ability to make decisions and organization during restoration projects, increasing students' awareness of conservation, developing students' ability to distinguish between construction types, developing students' understanding, and providing students with the understanding regarding the significance of the work, they stated that objectives were achieved partially by the students. Objectives related to developing students' psychomotor skills and hand-drawing skills were not achieved, and students could not be given detailed information about the processes and procedures of restoration

Similarly, graduates thought the program contributed in developing their measurement skills, drawing skills, project preparation and reporting procedures and application of projects to some degree. However, due to the inefficiency of practical courses, instructors' tendency to use traditional methods and practices and some pedagogical drawbacks, students absenteeism, lack of knowledge about construction materials and field practice graduates do not feel competent enough.

Moreover, statements of employers supported the views of students, instructors and graduates. It was stated by employers that the graduates meet employers' demands partially as graduates show somewhat competency in drawing and they cannot manage projects and needs guidance and support. Graduates were found by employers to have poor/low, enthusiasm and practical knowledge.

According to employers, the graduates who had workplace experience knew what were required and improved themselves accordingly both at school and workplace.

These results are consistent with the results of some studies in the literature. The studies in Turkey have mainly focused on the skills shortages (Sarikaya, 2010; SVET, 2006; TEPAV, 2007). The studies also indicated that there is a mismatch between the skills and knowledge provided by vocational schools and demands of the employers.

Also, in TÜSİAD report (1999), higher vocational schools in Turkey were assessed as making less contribution to higher education system when compared to universities because of their share in the system, and of equipment (financial) and management problems they experience. This report marks that secondary and post-secondary vocational schools need to be restructured and new management models be developed and introduced. Moreover, collaboration with business communities in order to understand demands of labor market and to keep up with the change in the market is urgently needed.

As the results from the present study and abovementioned studies indicate, the performance and structure post-secondary vocational education institutions is not efficient enough to train the qualified graduates to be employed by the businesses whose main concern is to compete in the global environment (TÜSİAD, 1999).

Implications

This study highlights the importance of aligning employability with academic and business values by making explicit links between the curriculum, workplace and employability. It is incumbent upon students, educators and employers to do well in their respective positions. While students need to develop the skills needed to enter and to advance their career potential, educators need to design their courses to include the skills that students need and employers expect. As indicated in the project prepared by the Business, Industry and Higher Education Collaboration Council in Australia (2007) teaching staff also need to be equipped with suitable skills, resources and awareness of current industry practice in order to provide their students with the right and necessary employability skills. Employers' and educators' roles are reported in the same project to develop students' employability skills by having students participate in work integrated learning programs. Apart from the training at colleges and universities, students are recommended to achieve employability skills where they have access to relevant work experience.

Limitations

The most important limitation of this study is time. Because of limited time, the curriculum implementation process could not be observed. As the models utilized in this study require data about objectives and outcomes, other components of curriculum were not evaluated but described through document analysis. Moreover, as college administrators were not available during data collection process, they could not be included among data sources

References

Bloom, D. E., Canning, D., & Chan, K. (2006). *Higher education and economic development in Africa* (No. 102). Washington, DC: World Bank.

Business, Industry and Higher Education Collaboration Council. (2007). *Graduate employability skills*. Commonwealth of Australia. Precision Consultancy. Canadian Labour Force Development Board. (1994). *Putting the pieces together: towards a coherent transition system for Canada's labour force*. Ottawa: CLFDB.

Cohen, A. M., & Brawer, F. B. (2003). *The American community college*. John Wiley & Sons.

Education Research Foundation of Turkey (TEPAV), (2007). *Higher education and labour market in Turkey*. TEPAV, Ankara.

Fitzpatrick, J. L., Sanders, J. R., & Worthen, B. R. (2004*). Program evaluation: Alternative approaches and practical guidelines* (3rdedt.). USA: Pearson Publication.

Fraenkel, J. R., & Wallen, N. E. (2006). *How to design and evaluate research in education*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Gredler, M. E. (1996). *Program evaluation*. USA: Pearson Education Company.

Harvey, L. (2000). New realities: the relationship between higher education and employment. *Tertiary Education and Management, 6*, 3-17.

Krippendorff, K. (2004). *Content Analysis: An Introduction to Its Methodology*. 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

Krueger, W.,J., & Casey, V. L. P. (2011). *Designing and conducting mixed methods research* (2nded). Thousand Oaks, CA. SAGE Publications

Lederer, J. E. (2005). *Promoting Lifelong Learning: An Analysis of Community College Delivery of Employer-Focused Education and Training*. Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses.

Miles, M., & Huberman, A. M. 1994. *Qualitative data analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

National Qualifications Institution(NQI) (2013). National qualifications of conservation and restoration staff (Level 4). Retrieved from http://www.myk.gov.tr/images/articles/editor/2013/ 210113/Tarihli_Eser Koruma_ve_Restorasyon_Elemani_seviye_4.pdf on April, 2013.

OECD. (2008). *Education at a Glance*. OECD Publishing.

Ozmon, H. A., & Craver, S. M. (2007). *Philosophical foundations of education* (8th Ed.). Columbus, OH: Merrill Publishing Co.

Sarıkaya, Y. (2011). *Investigating stakeholders' perceptions of employability factors: Evidence from a vocational college in Nevşehir.* [Paydaşların istihdam edilebilirlik faktörlerine ilişkin algılarının incelenmesi: Nevşehir'de bir yüksekokulu örneği]. Unpublished master thesis, Middle East Technical University, Ankara.

Schiro, M. (2008). *Curriculum theory: Conflicting visions and enduring concerns*. Los Angeles/ London: SAGE.

SVET (2006): *Strengthening the role of the social partners and social dialogue in the vocational education and training system in turkey* (Policy Paper). SVET, Ankara

Tashakkori, A. & Eddie, C. (2002). *Handbook of mixed methods in social & behavioral research.* Sage Publications.

The Secretary's Commission on Achieving Necessary Skills. (1991). *What work requires of schools: a scans report for America 2000.* US Department of Labor, Washington.

Tsang, C. Mun (1997). The cost of vocational training. *International Journal of Manpower, 18*(1/2), 63-89.

TÜSİAD (Turkish Industry and Business Association). (1999). *Restructuring vocational and technical education.* TÜSİAD-T / 99-2 / 252.

World Bank (2002). *Global competitiveness report*. World Economic Forum.

Ziderman, A. (1997). National programmes in technical and vocational education: Economic and education relationships. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training, 49*(3), 351-366.

Geniş Türkçe Özet

Kapadokya İki Yıllık Meslek Yüksek Okulu Restorasyon Programının Değerlendirilmesi

Kapadokya Meslek Yüksekokulu (KMYO) Restorasyon eğitim programı 2005-2006 yılında Nevşehir'deki mevcut tarihi ve doğal yapıların yeniden kazandırılması çalışmaları doğrultusunda bölgedeki işverenlerin teknik eleman ihtiyacını karşılamak amacıyla açılmıştır. Bu amaçla, eğitim programı oluşturulurken, mezun öğrencilere istihdam sağlayacak işverenler, restorasyon ve koruma alanında uzman olan mimarlar ve koruma kurulu temsilcileri program geliştirme komisyonu içinde yer almıştır. Ancak, 2005 yılından beri programın işverenlerin ihtiyaçları ve taleplerini karşılama konusundaki etkililiği hakkında herhangi bir program değerlendirme çalışması yapılmamıştır. Bu nedenle, mevcut eğitim programının Nevşehir'de faaliyet gösteren iş dünyasının gerektirdiği bilgi ve becerileri kazandırma konusunda etkililiği, programın hedeflenen çıktılara ulaşma düzeyi ve programın asıl çıktılarının araştırılması ve program geliştirme komisyonunun bilgilendirilmesi gerekmektedir.

Bu araştırmanın amacı; (1) ön lisans düzeyindeki Restorasyon programının etkililiğinin ikinci sınıf öğrencileri, öğretim elemanları, mezun ve işveren algıları doğrultusunda değerlendirilmesi, (2) eğitim programında belirtilmeyen ve program amaçları arasında yer almayan program çıktılarının belirlenmesi, (3) Restorasyon programının çıktılarına ulaşma düzeyinin ortaya çıkarılması ve (4) programın nasıl iyileştirileceği konusunda bilgi toplamaktır. Ayrıca, yapılan çalışmanın sonuçlarının, hem KMYO'daki diğer programların hem de diğer meslek yüksekokullardaki programların değerlendirilmesinin gerekliliği konusunda bir farkındalık oluşturması ve bir yol göstermesi beklenmektedir. Bu çalışmada, araştırma yöntemi olarak, Restorasyon programı hakkında daha detaylı ve daha geniş bir perspektiften bilgi vereceği düşünülen karma yakınsak-paralel (convergent parallel) yöntem benimsenmiştir (Creswel & Clark 2011; Fraenkel & Wallen, 2006). Program değerlendirme modeli olarak ise, programın amaçlarına ulaşıp ulaşmadığının değerlendirilmesi için kullanılan Tyler'ın (1973) Amaç Odaklı Değerlendirme modeli ile birlikte programın çok boyutlu değerlendirmesinin yapılabilmesi ve programın amaçları dışında kazandırdıklarının da belirlenmesi amacıyla Scriven'ın (1991) Amaçtan Bağımsız Değerlendirme modeli kullanılmıştır. Programın tüm boyutları hakkında veri toplamak için öğrenciler, öğretim elemanları, işverenler ve mezunlardan oluşan dört farklı paydaş grubundan veri toplanmıştır. Çalışmaya, Mayıs 2013'te ikinci sınıfta ve mezun olmak üzere olan 28 öğrencinin tamamı, programda eğitim veren 7 öğretim elemanının tamamı, Nevşehir ilinde çalışmakta olan veya herhangi bir işte çalışmayan ve Nevşehir'de ikamet eden 6 mezun ve işyerinde KMYO Restorasyon programı mezunu çalışanı olan 2 işveren ile bu programdan çalışanı olmayan 2 işveren olmak üzere toplam 4 işveren katılmıştır. Veri toplama sürecinde yazılı doküman, araştırmacılar tarafından hazırlanan bireysel görüşme, odak grup görüşmesi ve anketten faydalanılmıştır. Bu araçların dışında, Restorasyon bölümü eğitim programı ve Mesleki Yeterlilik Kurumu'nun Tarihi Eser Koruma ve Restorasyon Elemanı (Seviye 5) için oluşturduğu mesleki yeterlik çerçevesi de içerik analizi yöntemi ile incelenmiştir. Tyler'ın (1973) ve Scriven'ın (1991) değerlendirme modellerinin farklı açılardan değerlendirme yapması nedeniyle verilerin güvenirliğini de sağlamak amacıyla, her iki değerlendirme modeli için iki farklı araştırmacı veri toplama araçlarının geliştirilmesinde ve veri toplanmasında birbirlerinden bağımsız bir şekilde çalışmışlardır. Veri analiz sonuçları, genel olarak programın paydaşların ihtiyaç ve taleplerini karşılama konusunda yeterince etkili olmadığını göstermiştir. Öğrencilerden anket yoluyla toplanan nicel veri SPSS 20.0 ile analiz edilmiş ve öğrencilerin program amaçlarına verdiği önemle amaçlara ulaşma düzeylerini arasında istatistiksel olarak anlamlı bir fark olduğu bulunmuştur ($p<.05$). Öğrencilerle yapılan odak grup görüşmesinde elde edilen veriler, öğretim elemanlarının yeterince yönlendirme yapmaması, araç ve gereçlerin yetersiz olması, meslek derslerinin sayısının az olması, iki yıllık sürenin mesleği öğrenmek için yeterli olmaması ve bazı derslerin pratikten ziyade kuram ağırlıklı yürütülmesi eğitim programında belirtilen amaçlara ulaşamama nedenleri olarak göstermiştir. Öğretim elemanlarına göre program, öğrencilerin dil becerilerini geliştirmede yeterince

etkili olduğu halde restorasyon projelerinde problem çözme ve karar verme, organizasyon becerilerini geliştirme, koruma farkındalığını artırma, yapı çeşitlerini ayırma, restorasyonun önemini kavratma konusunda kısmen etkilidir. Öğretim elemanları, programın öğrencilerin psikomotor ve yazma becerileri ile restorasyon çalışmalarının yürütülmesi ile ilgili süreçler ve prosedürlerle ilgili bilgi ve becerilerini yeterince geliştirmediği görüşündedirler. Mezunlara göre program, öğrencilerin ölçme, çizim, proje hazırlama ve raporlama süreçleri ile proje uygulama becerilerini geliştirmelerinde etkiliyken, uygulama derslerinin az olması, öğretim elemanlarının öğretim metot ve stratejileri konusunda yeterli olmaması, motivasyonu düşük ve devamsız olan öğrenciler ve yapı malzemeleri ile uygulama alanında eksik bilgi ve beceriler sebebiyle etkili olmamıştır. İşverenler ise diğer katılımcıların görüşlerini destekleyerek, mezunların çizim konusunda orta düzeyde iyi oldukları, ancak proje yönetimi konusunda rehberlik ve desteğe ihtiyaçları olduğunu belirtmişlerdir.

Yapılan bu çalışma, Restorasyon bölümü eğitim programının paydaşların talep ve ihtiyaçlarını karşılamada yetersiz olduğunu ve programın paydaşların görüşleri dikkate alınarak gözden geçirilmesi gerektiğini göstermektedir. Araştırma sonuçları alan yazındaki bazı çalışmalarla paralellik göstermektedir. Türkiye'de yapılan benzer çalışmalarda beceri eksikliklerine odaklanmıştır (Sarıkaya, 2011; TÜRKCONFED, 2006; TEPAV, 2007). Bu çalışmalar, işveren talepleri ile okulda edinilen bilgi ve becerilerin tam anlamıyla örtüşmediğine işaret etmektedir. Hem bu değerlendirme çalışması hem de bahsedilen diğer araştırmalar mesleki eğitim kurumlarının küresel çevre ile rekabet içinde olan iş dünyasınca ihtiyaç duyulan işgücünün yetiştirilmesinde yeterince etkili olmadığına işaret etmekte (TÜSİAD, 1999) ve işgücü piyasası ile mesleki eğitim kurumları arasındaki bağı kurmak ve güçlendirmek için gerekli düzenlemelerin yapılmasının elzem olduğunu göstermektedir.